- 1		
1 2 3 4 5 6	JEFFREY LEE COSTELL (SBN 93688) jlcostell@costell-law.com JOSHUA S. STAMBAUGH (SBN 233834) jstambaugh@costell-law.com SARA M. MCDUFFIE (SBN 252187) smcduffie@costell-law.com COSTELL & ADELSON LAW CORPORA 20969 Ventura Blvd., Suite 230 Woodland Hills, CA 91364 Telephone: (310) 458-5959 Facsimile: (310) 458-7959	SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA MAR 15 2023 K. Rahlwes
8 9	Attorneys for <i>Petitioners and Plaintiffs</i> GEORGE PADILLA and SHARON MOREN Individually on Behalf of Themselves and All Similarly Situated	· ·
10		
11	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
12	FOR THE COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE	
13		
14	GEORGE PADILLA and SHARON MORENO, Individually on Behalf of	Case No. RIC2003782
15	Themselves and All Others Similarly Situated,	
16		[BR@P@SED] FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS SETTLEMENT ORDER AND
17	Petitioners and Plaintiffs,	JUDGMENT ORDER AND
18	v.	Date: March 15, 2023
19	MISSION SPRINGS WATER DISTRICT and DOES 1-25, inclusive,	Time: 8:30 a.m. Dept.: 3
20	Respondents and Defendants.	Action Filed: September 24, 2020
21	•	Trial Date: None set
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1 2

FINAL APPROVAL ORDER AND JUDGMENT

The Motion for Final Approval of Class Settlement (the "Motion") of Petitioners and Plaintiffs George Padilla and Sharon Moreno, individually on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated ("Plaintiffs"), came on for hearing on March 15, 2023, at 8:30 a.m., in Department 3 of the above-referenced Court, the Hon. Chad Firetag presiding. The Motion was unopposed and no class members opted-out or filed objections. Plaintiffs appeared by Class Counsel, Jeffrey Lee Costell of Costell & Adelson Law Corporation, and Defendant Mission Springs Water District (the "District") appeared by its counsel, Thomas S. Slovak, Esq., of Slovak Baron Empey Murphy & Pinkney LLP. All other appearances are as noted in the Court's record.

After reviewing and considering the papers filed in support of the unopposed Motion, including the Notice of Motion and Motion for Final Approval of Class Settlement, the Memorandum of Points and Authorities, the Declarations of Joshua S. Stambaugh, Meagan Brunner, George Padilla and Sharon Moreno in support thereof, the parties' Class Action Settlement Agreement attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**, and any oral argument presented at the time of hearing, and good cause appearing therefor,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED AS FOLLOWS:

1. The Motion is GRANTED.

The Court approves the parties' settlement as set forth in the written Settlement Agreement attached hereto as **Exhibit 1**.

- 2. The Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action, the Plaintiffs, the Class Members, and the District.
- 3. The Court finds that the dissemination of the Class Notice with respect to the Settlement, as provided for in the Court's October 26, 2022 Preliminary Approval Order, constituted the best notice practicable under the circumstances to all Class Members, and fully met the requirements of California law and due process under the U.S. Constitution. Based on the evidence and other material submitted in conjunction with the Preliminary Approval Motion, the Court finds that the notice provided to the Class was adequate.
 - 4. The Court finds in favor of settlement approval and hereby enters final Judgment in this

case in accordance with the terms of the Settlement, as defined herein, the Court's October 26, 2022 Preliminary Approval Order, and this Final Approval Order and Judgment. The parties are hereby ordered to comply with the terms of the Settlement and this Final Approval Order and Judgment.

- 5. The Court approves the settlement of the above-captioned action as set forth in the Settlement, including the releases therein, as fair, just, reasonable and adequate as to the parties and the Class. The parties are directed to perform in accordance with the terms of the Settlement.
- 6. All of the Released Class Claims and Released District Claims are hereby released upon the Effective Date, as defined in the Settlement.
- 7. Solely for purposes of effectuating the Settlement, this Court has certified a provisional class of all Class Members, as defined by the terms of the Settlement, and the Court deems this definition sufficient for purposes of California Rules of Court, Rules 3.765(a) and 3.771. Specifically, the Court hereby certifies the following Class for settlement purposes only: "All persons and entities who were billed and/or paid any amount to the Mission Springs Water District for water service that was billed using estimates rather than operational metered use from March 6, 2019 through May 18, 2022, who did not submit an opt-out in this lawsuit on or before January 30, 2023."
- 8. With respect to the Class and for purposes of approving the Settlement only and for no other purpose, the Court finds and concludes that: (a) the Class members are ascertainable and so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable; (b) there are questions of law or fact common to the Class, and there is a well-defined community of interest among Class Members with respect to the subject matter of the claims in this action; (c) the claims of the plaintiffs are typical of the claims of the Class Members; (d) the plaintiffs have fairly and adequately protected the interests of the Class Members; (e) a class action is superior to other available methods for an efficient adjudication of this controversy; and (f) Class Counsel, Costell & Adelson Law Corporation, are qualified to serve as counsel for the plaintiffs in their individual and representative capacities and for the Class.
- 9. Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement, the District shall issue each Class Member existing customer a credit on their monthly invoice for the refund amount owed to each Class Member existing customer in accordance with the formula set forth in Section 9(c)(i)-(iii) of the Settlement Agreement within 90 days after the "Effective Date" as defined at Section 2(f) of the Settlement Agreement.

- 10. Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement, the District and/or the Settlement Administrator shall issue each former Class Member former customer a check for the refund amount owed to each Class Member former customer in accordance with the formula set forth in Section 9(c)(i)-(iii) of the Settlement Agreement within 90 days after the "Effective Date" as defined at Section 2(f) of the Settlement Agreement. The envelope transmitting the settlement distribution shall bear the notation: "YOUR CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT CHECK IS ENCLOSED." Any settlement distribution check shall be negotiable for at least 90 days, but not more than 180 days, from the date of mailing. The District and/or the Settlement Administrator shall mail a reminder postcard to any class member whose settlement distribution check has not been negotiated within 60 days after the date of mailing.
- 11. If, after the issuance of all refunds to Class Members, some portion thereof remains unclaimed in the Settlement Fund, such funds shall be transferred by the District to its United Way Help to Others Fund, a charitable fund established by the District to assist qualified District residents with their water bills. United Way of the Desert is located at 73710 Fred Waring Drive, #104, Palm Desert CA, 92260.
- 12. Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement and Class Plaintiffs' unopposed Motion for Attorneys' Fees and Costs dated February 21, 2023, the District shall pay Class Counsel, Costell & Adelson Law Corporation, attorneys' fees and costs of \$100,000 in accordance with Section 12(c) of the Settlement within seven (7) days after the "Effective Date," as defined in the Settlement Agreement. The Court finds that this amount is fair and reasonable.
- 13. Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement, the District shall pay the Claims Administrator (Simpluris, Inc.) the amount of \$27,575.27 for its fees and costs relating to the claims administration process. The Court finds that this amount is fair and reasonable.
- 14. Without affecting the finality of this Final Approval Order and Judgment in any way, the Court hereby retains exclusive and continuing jurisdiction over this action, the plaintiffs, the Class and the District for purposes of supervising the implementation, enforcement, construction, administration and interpretation of the Settlement and this Judgment.
- The parties are ordered to cause a copy of this Final Approval Order and Judgment to be posted by the Claims Administrator (Simpluris, Inc.) on the settlement website,

1	www.MSWDClassActionSettlement.com, in order to provide notice to the Class pursuant to California		
2	Rules of Court, Rule 3.771(b).		
3	16. This Final Approval Order and Judgment shall constitute a judgment for purposes of		
4	California Rules of Court, Rule 3.769(h).		
5			
6	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
7			
8			
9			
10	Dated: Morch 15, 2023 Honorable Chad Firetag		
11	JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT		
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	5		